



October 5, 2015

Frances Brewster  
CAMT Co-chair  
Santa Clara Valley Water District  
5750 Almaden Expressway  
San Jose, CA 95118

Sam Luoma  
CAMT Co-chair  
John Muir Institute of Environment  
University of California Davis  
Davis, CA 95616

**Re: Report of the Delta Science Program Independent Review Panel on CAMT Proposed Investigations on the Delta Smelt Fall Outflow**

Dear Mrs. Brewster and Dr. Luoma:

The Delta Science Program is pleased to provide the enclosed review report titled "***Independent Review Panel (IRP) Report of the Collaborative Adaptive Management Team (CAMT) Proposed Investigations on Characterization of Relations between Autumn Outflow and Survival, Recruitment, and Habitat Quality for Delta smelt (*Hypomesus transpacificus*), Collaborative Adaptive Management Team Work Element 3-1-3***". The transmittal of this report fulfills a request from the Collaborative Adaptive Management Team (CAMT) Delta Smelt Scoping Team (DSST) to provide an independent external review of the proposed "*Characterization of relations between autumn outflow and survival, recruitment, and habitat quality for delta smelt (*Hypomesus transpacificus*)*".

The overall goal of this peer review was to inform the CAMT on the scientific quality of the proposed work and to respond to the review charge questions. The review provides general recommendations such as prioritization of proposal goals and consideration of movements in terms of tidal 'surfing' processes, as well as specific suggestions on simulation of environmental covariates, modeling abundance, survival and recruitment, detecting collinearity among covariates, and regions designation.

The independent review panel consisted of Dr. James J. Anderson (Lead Author), Dr. James A. Gore, Dr. Robert T. Leaf, Dr. Mary C. Fabrizio, and Dr. Charles Yackulic. These science experts were selected for their expertise and reputation in the fields of fisheries ecology, population dynamics, estuarine ecology and environmental statistics.

Detailed information on this and other reviews conducted by the Delta Science Program can be found on the [Delta Science Program website](#). The Delta Science Program was pleased to assist in

---

*"Coequal goals" means the two goals of providing a more reliable water supply for California and protecting, restoring, and enhancing the Delta ecosystem. The coequal goals shall be achieved in a manner that protects and enhances the unique cultural, recreational, natural resource, and agricultural values of the Delta as an evolving place."*

– State Water Code §85054

the process of evaluating the scientific integrity and quality of the directed research investigation under the CAMT process.

If there are questions about the review, IRP report or the overall process, please contact Martina Koller, Senior Environmental Scientist, Delta Science Program, at (916) 445-5838.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Clifford M. Dahm".

Cliff Dahm, Ph.D.  
Lead Scientist, Delta Science Program  
Delta Stewardship Council

Enclosure

Cc: Paul R. Brown, CAMT Facilitator, Paul Redvers Brown Inc.

Bruce DiGennaro, CAMT DSST Facilitator, Consultant, The Essex Partnership